

Ethics Office

68 Mitchell Street, SW, Suite 1100 Atlanta, GA 30303 404-330-6286

ethicsofficer@atlantaga.gov

2021 Financial Disclosure Statement Audit Report

Each year pursuant to Section 2-814 of the Atlanta Code of Ethics, elected officials, certain employees, and city board members are required to disclose assets and income sources to the Ethics Office on the City Financial Disclosure Statement. The Ethics Office audits a percentage of the statements received and information submitted for completeness and accuracy and monitors for potential conflicts of interest and omissions of business interests and other employment. The process and results are outlined in this report. For a blank copy of the 2021 City Financial Disclosure Statement, please *see Appendix A*.

Section 2-814 of the Atlanta City Code

Section 2-814 is a critical component of the Ethics Code, and specifies the officials, employees and board members required to file the City Financial Disclosure Statement. For Section 2-814, please see Appendix B.

Officials and employees are required to disclose the following on the financial disclosure statement including:

- 1. Positions of employment outside of city income. This includes personal business entities.
- 2. Sources of income above \$5,000.
- 3. Family members' employment with the city.
- 4. Family members' contractual agreements with the city.
- 5. Ownership of real estate in the state of Georgia.
- 6. Ownership of stocks, bonds and other debt obligations in excess of \$10,000 (only for specific filers.)

History of Financial Disclosure Statement Audits

Early years of the program and selected groups for audits

The Ethics Office's auditing process began in 2017 with an inaugural audit and continues to develop and expand each year. Audits for the 2018, 2019, 2020 and 2021 years have included two tiers. The first tier for each audit consists of city elected officials and high-level employees, specifically department heads and their deputies. The second tier consists of a group of employees from city departments identified each year. The selected group for the 2018 audit consisted of inspectors from all departments. The selected group for the 2019 audit included employees in the Department of Procurement and Office of Contract Compliance. The selected group for the 2020 audit consisted of employees in the Department of Finance. The selected group for the 2021 audit consisted of employees in the Department of City Planning and the Department of Aviation. The second tier also includes filers flagged in audits for previous years.

Results of the 2020 Financial Disclosure Statement Audit

The 2020 financial disclosure season was comprised of 3,480 required filers. The audit sought review whether required filers were complying with Section 2-814, specifically, disclosure of all sources of income, outside business entities, family members employed by the city, and real estate ownership. The two tiers of the population, as described above, with tier one consisting of elected officials and high-level employees, and the second tier consisting of employees in the department of finance, and employees who had been flagged in previous audits, totaled 302 individuals whose financial disclosure statements were audited. Of those audited, eleven were sent communications from our office requesting clarification and amended statements if appropriate; five filers acknowledged an error and filed an amended statement; six were forwarded to the Ethics Investigator for further review and investigation if necessary, and nine became former employees after their 2020 financial disclosure filings, therefore, no further action was taken.

Overview of the 2021 Audit

The 2021 financial disclosure season consisted of 3,256 required filers. As in previous years, the audit was split into two tiers with the first tier consisting of elected officials and high-level employees. Results from the first tier are outlined below in *Exhibit 1*. The second tier of the 2021 audit consists of employees in the Department of City Planning and Department of Aviation, and employees who had been flagged in previous audits. Results from the second tier are outlined in *Exhibit 2*. A total of 483 filers, representing approximately 15% of all required filers, were audited between both tiers.

2021 Audit Process

The process of auditing financial disclosure statements is generally as follows:

1	Reviewed 2021 financial disclosure statement for completeness.	Noted potential omissions or potential errors.
2	Compared 2021 statements with 2019 and 2020 statements for consistency.	Noted inconsistencies for further review.
3	If necessary, performed a "look- ahead" review of 2022 and 2023 financial disclosure statements if available.	For persons with noted omissions or inconsistencies in steps 1 and 2 above, reviewed 2022 and 2023 financial disclosure statements if available, and noted discrepancies.
4	Public records search	Performed a public records search using TLO (TransUnion subscription service) to compare a person's known business entities with entities disclosed on financial disclosure statement.
5	Public records search	Performed records search using Georgia Secretary of State website to note business activity based on entities revealed in TLO.
6	Public records search	Performed various records searches as necessary in county tax assessors' websites, governmentcontracts.us, and Small Business Administration website, among others, as necessary.
7	Social media and internet search	Performed basic searches using Linked In, Facebook and Google, as necessary.
8	Internal City of Atlanta records searches	Performed searches using City of Atlanta Final Action Legislation page and Oracle to review vendor/supplier activity, as necessary.

2021 Audit Findings

The following two Exhibits provide a summary of our findings, if any, from the process listed above. The resolution for each finding may fall under one of the following categories:

- A. Sent letter to filer requesting clarification;
- B. Filer acknowledged error and filed an amended statement;
- C. Referred to Ethics Investigator for further review;
- D. Former employee; did not pursue.

Exhibit 1 First Tier 2021 Audit – Findings and Actions Taken

First Tier consists of elected officials and high-level employees

AUDIT #	DEPT	POSITION	FINDING	ACTION TAKEN	RESOLUTION
1002	Parks & Recreation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Former employee; did not pursue	D
1010	Procurement	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Former Employee; did not pursue	D
1030	Customer Service	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Former Employee; did not pursue	D
1033	Law	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Former Employee; did not pursue	D
1035	Law	Employee	Did not disclose entities	Letter requesting clarification	Α
1037	Executive Offices	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Former Employee; did not pursue	D
1058	Transportation	Employee	Potential conflict of interest; Did not disclose entity	Former employee; did not pursue	D
1065	City Solicitor	Employee	Did not disclose entities	Letter requesting clarification	В
1140	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	В
1148	Finance	Employee	Did not disclose foreign entity	Former Employee; did not pursue	D

Exhibit 2 Second Tier 2021 Audit – Findings and Actions Taken Second Tier consists of employees in the Department of City Planning and Aviation, and employees flagged in prior audits.

AUDIT #	DEPT	POSITION	FINDING	ACTION TAKEN	RESOLUTION
2018	City Planning	Employee	Source of outside income does business with the City	Former Employee and cooling off period expired; did not pursue	D
2063	City Planning	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2073	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2147	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2192	City Planning	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2195	City Planning	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	В
2199	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	В
2224	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2248	Aviation	Employee	Potential COI	Former Employee; did not pursue	D
2281	City Planning	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2289	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	Α
2295	City Planning	Employee	Did not disclose entity	Letter requesting clarification	В
2312	Aviation	Employee	Did not disclose entities	Letter requesting clarification	В

Preliminary results of the audit were presented to the Ethics Officer for further review:

- 14 filers were sent a letter from the Ethics Analyst requesting clarification and amended statements, where appropriate.
- 6 filers filed amendments to statements filed.
- 9 filers became former employees after their 2021 financial disclosure filings, and no further action was taken.

An increased numbers of filers disclosing outside entities than prior years.

The number of filers disclosing outside entities has increased since 2017 when the audit program began. In previous years' audits, we observed that filers failed to disclose entities based on the entity being a non-profit organization, a church-based organization, or a new organization that had not yet begun receiving revenue.

In the second tier of the 2020 audit, the Analyst discovered that approximately 40% of persons audited who had a business entity registered with the Georgia Secretary of State did not disclose that entity on their financial disclosure statement. In the second tier of the 2021 audit, that number had decreased to approximately 22% of persons audited who did not disclose a business entity registered with the Secretary of State.

The Ethics Office has made efforts to educate filers on the importance of disclosing outside entities regardless of whether they are earning money or income from the entity. If an entity is registered with the Secretary of State and meets the definition of a business as defined by the Code of Ethics, the entity must be disclosed. When an entity is disclosed, that information becomes available to the public for review.

Future Years Financial Disclosure Statements and Goals for Auditing

The Ethics Office has found that the annual audits have expanded awareness among city employees regarding the importance of disclosing required information on their city financial disclosure statements. We have found that officials and employees have become more educated and informed about the purpose of the disclosure statement and more familiar with the filing requirements. We anticipate more filers will disclose outside employment and business interests, regardless of whether they are receiving money or income. We hope to audit a wider pool of required filers through an automated and streamlined audit process. Further, we will continue to communicate with individuals who are found to be associated with an entity that they did not disclose and seek explanations and amendments when appropriate.

Appendix A

2021 Financial Disclosure Statement

NOTICE OF PENALTIES:

THE FAILURE OF ANY OFFICIAL OR EMPLOYEE TO FILE BY APRIL 1, 2021, WITHOUT REASONABLE CAUSE SHALL RENDER THAT PERSON DELINQUENT AND MAY RESULT IN ADMINISTRATIVE SANCTIONS AFTER THE GRACE PERIOD ENDS ON APRIL 15, 2021.



ETHICS DIVISION

2021 FINANCIAL DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Filing Deadline: April 1, 2021

To be completed by city officials and employees who are currently serving or served in 2020 Reporting period since January 1, 2020

Name*				
	First	Middle		Last
The answers to q	uestions 2-5 are for adı	ministrative purposes on	ly and will not be	e made available online.
Home Address	*			
	Street			Apt.
City			State	Zip Code
Mailing Addres	s (if different)			_
Telephone Nur	nber*			
	Day	/-time	Oth	ner
E-mail Address	5 *			
REASONS FO	R FILING			
Note: You may Are you a cit Are you a cit Are you a mo or City Coun Are you a ne	need to select more y elected official or w y employee or were y ember of a city board cil to another public b ighborhood planning	on that applies to you. e than one category. ere you one in 2020? you one in 2020? , advisory commission board, or a city hearing unit chair or vice chair esident, or chief execu	or task force a officer, or wer	e you one in 2020? one in 2020?

commission, authority, or similar body, or were you one in 2020?

City Elected Officials. What is or was your position as a city elected official? ☐ Mayor ☐ Council President ☐ City Council Member ☐ Municipal Court Judge
Are you currently serving as an elected city official? ☐ Yes ☐ No (if no, answer the next question)
When was your last month as an elected city official? Month Year
Employees. What is or was your position with the City? Chief or Deputy Chief Operating Officer, Chief or Deputy Chief of Staff Commissioner, Department head, or its equivalent Deputy Commissioner, Deputy Department head, or its equivalent Employee in the Mayor's office who reports directly to the Mayor Other city employee
What is your specific city job title?
What is your city department or agency?
Are you currently employed with the City? Yes No (if no, answer the next question)
When was your last month and year on the city's payroll?
wontn Year
Board, Commission, Authority or Task Force Members & Hearing Officers
What is the name of the board or entity?
Are you currently serving in this position? Yes No (if no, answer the next question)
When was your last month of service? Month Year
Neighborhood Planning Unit Officers
Which neighborhood planning unit?
Which office do you hold in 2021? Chair, President, or Presiding Officer Vice Chair
Which office did you hold in 2020? Chair, President, or Presiding Officer Vice Chair
Executive Directors
What is the name of the board or entity?
Are you currently serving in this position? Yes No (if no, answer the next question)

When was your last month of service?		
,	Month	Year
SECTION ONE: SOURCES OF INCO	ОМЕ	
City Employment Income. Since January income from the City of Atlanta or a city payroll or were in 2020. Select no if your or city board member. Yes No	-related agency	
	nent, corporatior	employed by any business, organization, n, partnership, limited liability corporation, ntity).
☐ Yes ☐ No		
If you answered yes, list the name(s) of client or customer. Do not abbreviate or us		s). You are not required to list any individual le: John Smith Consultants, not JSC.
<u>(1)</u>		
(2)		
Choose the category listed below that be each entity. If you list more than one entry		ne type of business or services offered by name or number next to its category.
Arts and entertainment Construction Educational services Finance Food and accommodation services Government Health care Insurance Other category (describe)		Manufacturing Professional services Other services Real estate Retail trade Transportation Wholesale trade
If you checked professional or other ser Legal Accounting Consulting Public relations Other service (describe)	, , ,	
corporation, partnership, proprietorship,	ceived more the non-profit organ orporations? Sele	nan \$5,000 in annual income from any nization, or other business entity, including ect no if the income is investment income from nutual funds.

If you answered yes, or customer. Do not abb		ncome. You are not required	I to list any individual client		
<u>(1)</u>			_		
(2)					
		ne type of business or se one entry, state the entity nan			
Arts and entertainm Construction Educational service Finance Food and accommod Government Health care Insurance Other category (des	s dation services	☐ Manufacturing ☐ Professional serv ☐ Other services ☐ Real estate ☐ Retail trade ☐ Transportation ☐ Wholesale trade	vices		
of income engaged in	the City. Has any pers business with the City	TY son, employer, or entity the of Atlanta since January a faith, do not know whether it o	1, 2020? Select no if your		
Name	Business Address	Type of business or contract with the City	To which City Department or Agency were the services or products provided?		
How was the busines Competitive sealed Request for proposa					

Were you personally involved in any way in acquiring or doing work in connection with the business or contract for the City? \square Yes \square No				
If yes, explain fully				
paid or compensated to appear	r on behalf of any person, client u appeared on your own behalf in yo	e January 1, 2020, have you been or private interest before any city ur personal capacity as a city resident		
Name	Type of business with the city	Which City Department or Agency did you appear before?		
compensated to appear in co	ourt on behalf of any person o st the City of Atlanta or a city a	ry 1, 2020, have you been paid or or private interest in any action, gency or in which the City is the		
Federal Court Other (describe)				
What capacity did you appear? Attorney Expert witness Other (describe)				
SECTION THREE: FAMILY MEMBERS' TRANSACTIONS WITH THE CITY				
any of the following immediate mother, brother, sister, an add	family members: your spouse, re	has the City of Atlanta employed egistered domestic partner, father, use of a parent, sibling, or child?		
☐ Yes ☐ No				

Name	Relationship	City Department or Agency where relative works			
Do you directly supervise or an ☐ Yes ☐ No	re you directly supervised by the	e immediate family member?			
Family Transaction with the City. Since January 1, 2020, has your spouse, registered domestic partner, father, mother, brother, sister, adopted or natural child, or the spouse of a parent, sibling, or child received any benefit from any transaction with the City directly or through a business in which they have a majority or controlling interest? Select yes if you know, or with reasonable investigation should know, about the contract or other transaction with the City. Do not include any city employment listed in the last question. Yes No					
What is the family member's o	r business's name?				
What is your relationship? Spouse or registered domestic partner Father or mother Brother or sister Son or daughter A spouse of a parent, sibling, or child					
What is the Type of the transaction with the City? Contract Zoning matter Liquor license Grant or receipt of aid Other (describe)					
Which city department or ager	ncy is the transaction with?				
SECTION FOUR: REAL PR	ROPERTY				
State of Georgia? (Please inc		age or deed on any property in the sidence as property that you own) <i>ur home</i> .			

	Т			
City	Zip	Inside City of Atlanta		
		☐ Yes ☐ No		
		☐ Yes ☐ No		
		☐ Yes ☐ No		
		☐ Yes ☐ No		
SECTION FIVE: ADDITION	AL QUESTIONS FOR	CERTAIN DESIGNATED FILERS		
or deputy chief operating officers;	chief or deputy chiefs of sers, deputy department he	To be completed by city elected officials, chief staff; commissioners, department heads, or their eads, or their equivalents; and employees in the		
During 2020, did you hold more than \$10,000 in any stock, bond, blind trust, debenture, or other form of debt obligation of any corporation or business entity? Select no if your holdings are in mutual funds, personal checking accounts, time deposit accounts, other savings or retirement accounts held by a financial institution or the U.S. government, or any city deferred compensation or pension program. Yes No				
What is the name of the stock	, bond, blind trust, debe	enture, or other debt obligation?		
Relatives Employed by the C	City. To be completed by	the City Council President and members of the		
persons: your husband or wife brother, sister, or their spous grandchild; or any relative living	e; registered domestic p es; son, daughter, or th ng in your household; ar	f the following relatives or other related artner; father, mother, or their spouses; eir spouses; grandfather, grandmother, or ny person whom you intend to marry or ner natural person having the same legal		
Name	Relationship	City Department or Agency where relative works		

Identity of Individual Clients. To be completed be Council.	y the City Council President and members of the City
For each business that was a source of income ir customer, or patron that does or seeks business the City, is a registered lobbyist, or is a "prohibite (a) know that the client is a prohibited source and (business. Yes No	with the City, does or seeks official action from ed source" for another reason? Select yes if you
Name of Client, Customer or Patron	Address of Client, Customer or Patron
SECTION SIX: ACKNOWLEDGEMENT AND complete it.	SIGNATURE. You must sign your statement to
I understand and acknowledge that I will be requ one year following my last date of service with th	
By submitting this form, <i>I acknowledge and dec</i> reviewed this City Financial Disclosure Statement accurate, and complete statement of my current that intentionally filing a statement that contains the sanctions or other penalties.	it and to the best of my knowledge it is a true, financial and personal interests. I understand
Signature	 Date

Potential Civil Penalties for Violating Financial Disclosure Requirements

- Automatic fines for filing after **April 15**, **2021** (end of late-filing grace period)
- Listing in the Roll of Delinquent Filers posted on the Ethics Division website
- Public or Private Reprimand
- Recommendation to department head of disciplinary action up to a day's suspension without pay
- Recommendation to appointing authority of removal from office of any non-filing official
- Recommendation that former employees are ineligible for rehiring and former board members and NPU officers are ineligible for appointment for one year

Appendix B

Section 2-814 City of Atlanta Code of Ordinances

Sec. 2-814. - Disclosure of income and financial interests.

- (a) The officials and employees listed in subsection (b) of this section shall annually file statements with the ethics division disclosing the following:
 - (1) All positions of employment held by the official or employee in any business (as defined in section 2-801 (b)) for all or any portion of the year, including a description of the type of business and the existence and nature of any business done by the employer entity with the city.

 Lawyers, accountants, consultants, public relations representatives, and other persons rendering services for financial consideration shall disclose the organization, if any, with which they are connected, the type of services offered by the organization, and any particular segment of such services in which the member specializes;
 - (2) Each and every source of income from any business received by such official or employee in excess of \$5,000.00 derived from any single source in the preceding calendar year. Nothing in this section shall be construed to require reporting of the identity of individual clients, customers or patrons; however, the president of council and members of council shall include the information required to be reported under paragraph (d) of this section;
 - (3) Any benefit, whatever its nature, of such official's or employee's immediate family derived from transactions with the city or an agency, by employment, contract, or otherwise, either directly or through a business in which such immediate family member has a majority or controlling interest;
 - (4) All direct ownership interests in real property held by the official or employee; and
 - (5) All persons listed in subparagraphs (b)(1) through (8) of this section shall also disclose the identity of all stocks, blind trusts, bonds, debentures, and other forms of debt obligations of any corporation or any business or entity collectively in excess of \$10,000.00 held by the official or employee at any time during the year except for mutual funds, personal checking accounts, time deposit accounts, other savings or retirement fund accounts held by any financial institution of the United States government, or any city approved or maintained deferred compensation or pension program.
- (b) The following officials and employees shall be required to file annual statements disclosing information set forth in subsection (a) of this ordinance:
 - (1) Mayor;
 - (2) President of council;
 - (3) Members of council;
 - (4) Municipal court judges;
 - (5) Chief operating officer and deputy chief operating officers;
 - (6) Chief of staff and deputy chiefs of staff;

- (7) All employees of the office of the mayor who report directly to the mayor;
- (8) Commissioners, deputy commissioners, department heads and their equivalents;
- (9) Bureau directors, assistant bureau directors, managers and their equivalents;
- (10) Division heads and their equivalents;
- (11) Executive directors of city boards, commissions, authorities or other similar bodies;
- (12) Zoning administrator and any assistant zoning administrators;
- (13) Inspectors of all departments and bureaus;
- (14) City attorney, deputy, chief counsel, assistant, associate city attorneys and their equivalents;
- (15) Director of the office of contract compliance and employees of the office of contract compliance with discretionary or supervisory authority over certification, compliance, monitoring, or auditing;
- (16) Department of procurement deputies, contract administrators, contracting officers, buyers and their equivalents;
- (17) Within the department of finance, assistant directors and all employees who have discretionary or supervisory authority over the investment of city funds or the auditing of city finances or city contracts;
- (18) City internal auditor and employees of the office of internal auditor with investigative and supervisory authority over audits, the audit process, and audit reports;
- (19) Inspector general of the City of Atlanta, ethics officer, all employees of the office of the inspector general;
- (20) Administrative hearing officers and their equivalents;
- (21) Members, whether paid or unpaid, of all city boards, committees, councils, commissions, authorities and other similar bodies created by state law, Charter, ordinance or resolution;
- (22) Members appointed by the mayor and/or council or council president to other public boards, committees, councils, commissions, task forces, authorities of the city, county or state, or similar entities; and
- (23) Officers of neighborhood planning units; and
- (24) All positions for which the job descriptions or actual duties include negotiation, authorization, or approval of contracts, leases, franchises, revocable consents, concessions, variances, special permits, or licenses; the purchase, sale, rental, or lease of real property, personal property, or services, or a contract for any real or personal property or services; obtaining grants of money or loans; adoption or repeal of any rule or regulation having the force and effect of law; or positions for which the job description or actual job duties present a significant risk of a potential conflict of interest under division 2 of chapter 2 (Administration), article VII (Officers And Employees), of the Code of Ordinances, City of Atlanta, Georgia.

- (c) The municipal clerk shall maintain a list of all current members of all city boards, committees, authorities and commissions and all current members appointed by the mayor and council to other public boards, committees, councils, commissions, and authorities of the city, county, or state. The chief operating officer or his designee shall provide a complete list of all employees required to submit income disclosure forms as designated in subsection (b) of this ordinance, including the employee's name, title and department, to the municipal clerk and ethics division no later than January 5 of each calendar year. The ethics division shall prescribe the form and method of disclosure statement forms. The ethics division shall have such forms made available to each official and employee required to file disclosure statements, by no later than March 1 of each year. The failure of the ethics division to cause a disclosure form to be delivered to any official or employee required to file a disclosure statement. The ethics division shall maintain all completed disclosure forms as public documents available for public inspection immediately upon filing.
- (d) With respect to the president of council and members of council, if the official reports income from a business in accordance with paragraph (a) (2), said official shall be required to report the identity (name and address) of individual clients, customers, or patrons of the business when (i) the client, customer, or patron is a prohibited source; (ii) the official has actual knowledge that the client, customer, or patron is a prohibited source; and (iii) the official has actual knowledge that the prohibited source is a client, customer, or patron of the official's business.
- (e) Every official and employee required to file an annual disclosure statement shall do so on or before the close of business on April 1 of each year in which the official or employee holds a position with the city or an agency and for the year following that in which the official or employee leaves such position. Such official or employee shall sign such disclosure statement under penalty of perjury. The failure of any official or employee so required to file an annual disclosure statement by April 1 without reasonable cause shall render such person delinquent and result in an administration sanction of \$50.00 per day for each business day beyond April 1 of such delinquency, provided that the maximum penalty for the first offense shall be \$500.00.
- (f) The ethics division shall be responsible for collecting all administrative sanctions levied by the board under this section for deposit to the City of Atlanta General Fund.

(Ord. No. 2002-27, § 1, 4-10-02; Ord. No. 2013-54(13-O-1294), § 1, 10-30-13; Ord. No. 2016-25(16-O-1405), §§ 1, 2, 8-24-16; Ord. No. 2019-22(19-O-1038), § 5, 3-12-19; Ord. No. 2020-09(19-O-1729), § 7, 2-6-20; Ord. No. 2021-45(21-O-0501), § 1, 9-15-21)

State Law reference— Acceptance by public officers of monetary fees or honoraria, O.C.G.A. § 21-5-11.